

State of Vermont
Artificial Intelligence Task Force
Established Pursuant to Act 137 (H.378) of the 2017-2018 Legislative Session
Meeting No. 14
Friday December 6th, 2019 9:21 AM – 12:06 PM
Justin Morrill Conference Room, 6th Floor
Vermont Agency of Commerce and Community Development
1 National Life Drive
Montpelier, VT 05620

Members present— Jessica Vintinner; John Dooley; Joe Segale; John Cohn; James Lyall; Eugene Santos; Brian Cina; and Donna Rizzo.

Members absent— Brian Breslend; Jill Charbonneau; Mark Combs; Milo Cress; Trey Dobson; and Christopher Herrick.

Staff present—Ryan Flanagan

(9:21-9:33 a.m.) **Welcome, review of agenda, acceptance of October and November meeting minutes**

- ❖ At 9:21 a.m., the meeting started. The group focused their attention first on accessing the Google Drive to edit the document and discussed the editing process.
- ❖ At 9:32 a.m., Joe Segale put forth a motion to accept meeting minutes from October 17, 2019. Eugene Santos seconded the motion. Presiding Chair John Dooley requested a roll call for the vote, all voted in favor and the motion passed. 8-0-0.
 - ❖ Aye: Jessica Vintinner; John Dooley; Joe Segale; John Cohn; James Lyall; Eugene Santos; Brian Cina; and Donna Rizzo.
 - ❖ Nay: None
 - ❖ Abstain: None
- ❖ At 9:33 a.m., James Lyall put forth a motion to accept meeting minutes from November 4, 2019. John Cohn seconded the motion. Presiding Chair John Dooley requested a roll call for the vote, all voted in favor and the motion passed. 8-0-0.
 - ❖ Aye: Jessica Vintinner; John Dooley; Joe Segale; John Cohn; James Lyall; Eugene Santos; Brian Cina; and Donna Rizzo.
 - ❖ Nay: None
 - ❖ Abstain: None

(9:33 a.m.-12:04 p.m.) **Review, discussion and acceptance Final Report**

- ❖ (9:33-9:59 a.m.) **Report itself and preparation**

- ❖ The group focused their attention first on when it can get the draft report completed.
 - ❖ John Dooley decided that it was best to meet as a wordsmithing committee to fine tune the details of the report and its language.
 - ❖ Jessica Vintinner gave her availability and John Dooley decided that it was best to meet in the morning on Thursday December 12th to meet as a subcommittee. John Cohn and Donna Rizzo will try to attend this meeting. Joe Segale and Brian Cina noted that they can go if needed. The meeting will not focus on any substantive changes.
 - ❖ The group also noted that Legislature will begin meeting on January 7th of 2020. This will affect the availability of Jessica Vintinner. The group decided that they will have a Doodle Poll to best decide the meeting time. Possible meeting times before the Legislative session will be in the morning and possible meeting times after the Legislative session's start will take place in the afternoon.
 - ❖ James Lyall told the group that he finished the benefits and risks section. John Dooley noted that he read three different studies on job displacement and creation, which he wants incorporated into this section.
 - ❖ Brian Cina mentioned that he could not add to the Google Drive, but he created a section on economic incentives.
 - ❖ At 9:56 a.m., John Dooley left the meeting and Eugene Santos presided as chair.
- ❖ (9:59-10:00 a.m.) **Cover Page**
 - ❖ The group noted that they might want to change the cover page to incorporate some aspect of Vermont. Jess Vintinner told the group that she was fine with this decision if needed. At the request of Brian Cina, Jessica Vintinner also would find the task force's amendment to add to the report.
- ❖ (10:00-10:11 a.m.) **Table of Contents**
 - ❖ John Cohn noted that the executive summary and the introduction restate a lot of the same information. He suggested reversing the order of the executive summary and introduction, so the summary comes first. If the group has time, it was decided that it will add a process section to the introduction.
 - ❖ The section on regulation was also decided to go into the recommendation section.
 - ❖ Joe Segale noted that the actual legislative language can go at the back of the report in an appendix. The changes in labor force can also be put into the risks and benefits section.
 - ❖ It was also decided that there will be a conclusion at the end of the report. It will not exceed five sentences. Last, the definition of artificial intelligence (AI) will go in the introduction and executive summary to familiarize the reader with the topic.
- ❖ (10:11-10:12 a.m.) **Transmittal Letter**
 - ❖ The task force found that the transmittal letter needs minor edits, but it appears to be fine. With nothing else to discuss, the group moved on to the other elements of the report.
- ❖ (10:12-10:16 a.m.) **Statutory Charge**

- ❖ The task force decided that the statutory charge will be in the appendix section of the report.
 - ❖ Ryan Flanagan made a matrix for the task force membership. It was decided that Kayla Dewey, the previous Administrative Coordinator, will also go in the matrix. Titles such as co-chair, chair, doctor, etc. will also be added at the discretion of the members.
- ❖ (10:16-10:24 a.m.) **Introduction**
- ❖ As previously decided, the introduction will go after the executive summary section.
 - ❖ The introduction section will note the number of meetings (general and public), as well as provide a link to the appendix with meeting minutes.
 - ❖ James Lyall noted that he wanted something to be added about privacy and civil liberties. Most of the introduction section focuses on business, so he believed that adding these elements will limit the amount of bias.
- ❖ (10:24-10:41 a.m.) **Executive Summary**
- ❖ The group discussed possibly having a findings section but opted at this time.
 - ❖ It was decided to cut out the phrase ‘a majority of’ when discussing the group not recommending regulation at this time. It was also decided to add the word ‘promulgation’ regarding regulation of AI in Vermont. Ultimately, the task force recognized that it will not regulate specific applications of AI at this time; however, it realized that future monitoring might be needed and done by a permanent commission.
- ❖ (10:41-10:58 a.m.) **AI in Vermont**
- ❖ James Lyall noted that there is not extensive use of AI by law enforcement in Vermont, which appears to be a primary concern of the public. However, it is also a factor of cost. Currently, AI remains very costly and it does not fit within the budget of most police offices. In general, law enforcement is not implementing any AI applications that host as a potential threat.
 - ❖ At 10:56 a.m., Jess Vintinner left the meeting. At 10:58 a.m., the task force decided to take a quick break and returned to the meeting at 11:07 a.m..
- ❖ (11:07-11:12 a.m.) **Definition**
- ❖ As previously noted, the definition will now be present in both the introduction and executive summary to provide better clarification and understanding of the technology to the reader. The task force decided to use the Merriam Webster definition of AI and provided some justification for how it came to this decision.
- ❖ (11:12-11:23 a.m.) **State Regulation**
- ❖ It was decided that the State regulation section will be put under recommendations section in Part 4, subsection 6 of the final report.

- ❖ To make edits to this section, the task force will copy and paste the exact language that it used in the executive summary into the recommendation piece of state regulation, as well as into the last sentence of the rationale for this section.
- ❖ (11:23-11:28 a.m.) **Benefits and Risks**
 - ❖ In the benefits and risks section, John Cohn wanted the group to include something about the changing job landscape. Cohn volunteered to write an introduction for this section, which will then go into the risks, benefits, and labor effects.
 - ❖ John Cohn also noted that he wanted footnotes on global job displacement for this section. Reports vary and Cohn wanted the reader to know how these estimates are made. Two reports that have been widely used that estimate global job displacement are the Mackenzie and PwC report. Ryan Flanagan will put in any citations for these studies.
 - ❖ James Lyall told the group that he wanted more examples of how AI can be used by both businesses and government to streamline operations. John Cohn noted that he can include a piece on a computer service available to start-up companies; however, the group warned him of including anything that might be prescriptive. Ultimately, the task force was created to provide recommendations and not necessarily point to existing opportunities.
 - ❖ At 11:28 a.m., John Dooley returned to the meeting.
- ❖ (11:44 a.m.-12:03 p.m.) **Recommendations**
 - ❖ The group decided that recommendations would follow in the order of regulation, the establishment of a permanent commission, and then a code of ethics.
 - ❖ Brian Cina and John Cohn will review some of the recommendations regarding education and fine tune them.

(12:03-12:04 p.m.) **Public comment**

- ❖ At 12:03 p.m., John Dooley inquired as to any members of the public present to provide public comment or announcements, hearing none, moved to the last agenda item.

(12:04-12:06 p.m.) **Additional business**

- ❖ The next meeting date, time, and location will be decided shortly. Ryan Flanagan will work to make a Doodle Poll with a variety of different times to allow for maximum attendance from the group. The meeting information will also be put up on the State Library's website to advertise to the public. The public comment period for the last meeting will be one hour.
- ❖ Other additional action items included the subcommittee meeting for wordsmithing taking place on December 12th, workforce development section being incorporated with the education section, and Brian Cina working on the conclusion, which will be no more than five sentences.
- ❖ John Dooley inquired as to any other business, there being none requested a motion to adjourn. At 12:06 p.m., the meeting adjourned.